Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja's Nambudiri Religious and Charitable Endowments Bill.

PRESIDENT.

The next item of business is the introduction of the Nambudiri Religious and Charitable Endowments Bill by Mr. C. A. Kunjnnni Raja.

Mr. C. A. KUNJUNNI RAJA.

Sir, I do not propose to move the Bill in this meeting. Under S. O. 4, I can postpone it for the next sitting.

PRESIDENT.

Under the proviso to clause 2, S. O. 4, you have got a right to do so, and it may be carried over to the next meeting.

Resolutions on Matters of General Public Interest.

PRESIDENT.

We shall continue the discussion on Mr. Mathew's resolution regarding the Ayurvedic Hospital.

The Establishment of a Central Ayurvedic Hospital in the State.

Dr. A. R. MENON.

Mr. President, the stage has passed when any useful purpose would be served by discussing the merits and demerits of the respective systems of medicine. So far as we can gather from the discussion of yesterday, both systems have their relative merits and demerits. But a combination of these two will go a long way in solving the difficult problem of medical relief. The Allopathic system involves very great expenditure. The question is whether the Ayurvedic or the Allopathic system is more economical. Considering the importance of this question, I took infinite pains, and in consultation with the practitioners of both the Ayurvedic and Allopathic systems, I had prepared and submitted a Bill for introduction into this Council. But I regret that, owing to causes over which I have no control, the Bill has not yet been sanctioned, nor published in the Gazette, on the ground that there is a possibility that it may affect the revenues of the State. But, at the same time, the Diwan was pleased to sanction and to publish in the Gazette Mr. Salem's Old Age Pensions Bill, involving an expenditure of something like 5 or 6 lakhs of rupees. My Bill does not propose to deprive any Government officer of his salary. Hence those who are interested in this matter may go to their beds and sleep in peace.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Now, Sir, in my Bill all the aspects of this question are dealt with in detail, such as the construction of buildings, manufacture and distribution of medicines, principles of appointment and facilities for clinical teaching. There is no use of establishing a College without a Hospital attached to it. There is, however, one fundamental principle that I wish this House would keep in view, namely, that the Chief Medical Officer should not have any control whatever over the working of the Ayurvedic system. I will tell you why. Yesterday, in answer to a question, the Chief Medical Officer stated that not a pie was collected from the patients attending Allopathic Hospitals in the State, although a sum of more than 2½ lakhs was swallowed up by these Hospitals. It is a well-known fact that medicines are given gratis in these Hospitals not only to the poor but also to the rich. The Hospital authorities are more concerned with the interests of their private patients than with those of the Hospital-going population. Well-to-do private patients are not charged purposely, though the medicines intended for the poor are given to them freely. This questionable practice is prevalent in all the Hospitals in this State. I challenge the Chief Medical Officer to disprove this serious allegation. If he is inclined to question the truth of the allegation, I challenge the Government to appoint an impartial Committee, before whom I shall cite witnesses—men of light and leading who will prove the charge brought against the Hospital authorities. Another question was asked why the Tattamangalam Ayurvedic Dispensary was recommended to be abolished. The answer was that, though eight thousand rupees worth of medicine was supplied to it, no money was collected from the patients.

Dr A. G. MENON.

Not eight thousand rupees. It is only one thousand.

Dr. A. R. MENON.

All the better for my argument. Spending over two-and-a half lakhs of rupees and not recovering a pie does not disturb the equanimity of the Chief Medical Officer—because the Hospitals are Allopathic—while spending the paltry sum of a thousand rupees and not recovering anything from the patients becomes a grave crime, when it is an Ayurvedic Dispensary. Well, Sir, such is the mentality of the Chief Medical Officer, and now, you can see why he should have nothing to do with the control of Ayurvedic Institutions. The truth of the matter is that, if the Ayurvedic system is properly worked under State patronage, the Allopathic system is bound to suffer.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Mr. I. RAMAN MENON.

The Medical Department has nothing to do with the Ayurvedic system.

Dr. A. R. MENON.

I am only explaining the fate of these institutions, if they are placed under the Chief Medical Officer. I am glad they are under you. (*Laughter.*)

Mr. S. F. NUNEZ.

From what the Hon'ble Member said, it is undertsood that at present the Ayurvedic Department is under the Chief Medical Officer.

PRESIDENT.

Anyhow, he wants to be definite that it should be separate from the Chief Medical Officer's jurisdiction.

Dr. A. R. MENON.

Now, Sir, it is only fair to add that the Government have not extended the same help and sympathy to this indigeneous system of medicine, which they have done to the Allopathic system. While they are ready to pour out the public funds indiscriminately upon the latter, they have been very miserly in their financial support to the former. If this niggardliness is due to lack of funds, a Retrenchment Committee will be able to suggest how a reduction of nearly a lakh of rupees could be effected in the present expenditure on the Allopathic system.

Have you ever heard of such a very large number of doctors in any Hospital, as we have in the State? The Hospital at Trichur, when it was constructed, had only accommodation for one doctor and an assistant, and at present, doctors are sitting upon the tables, which I have seen with my own eyes. Sir, I know how the Hospital is working; 60 to 70 beds and 7 doctors! Is there anybody who has heard of such a thing? Compare these conditions with those obtaining at Palghat? This town is much larger and more populous than Trichur. With a Hospital of about the same size and the same number of beds as in Trichur, it is managed by two medical men. I do not like to criticise. But I do say that many of these appointments are made, not because of necessity for appointment, but these were created, since some people had to be provided for.

In the same way you can reduce the expenditure upon Hospitals and buildings. Hospitals are not made of marbles anywhere else. The Ernakulam Hospital looks like a Taj Mahal. Even eminent surgeons can perform an operation upon a table

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

costing Rs. 200 or so. In the case of our doctors they require tables costing Rs. 700 or so. Our people connot afford these expenses. If money is spent on the development of the Ayurvedic system, it would be of immense benefit to the people, the majority of whom live in rural areas. The Allopathic system is beyond their reach, because the Hospitals are located in towns.

These are some of the general observations, I wish to make. I would request the mover to withdraw this resolution, if the Government gives permission to move the Bill that I have submitted on this matter.

PRESIDENT.

Have you visited the Cheruvirutti Ayurvedic Hospital. Is it your opinion that it works on proper lines and deserves encouragement?

Dr. A. R. MENON.

No, Sir, I have not visited. The Hospital must be placed in a town, as we require clinical materials.

PRESIDENT.

There is a Karaleeya Ayurvedic Oushadhasala in British Malabar. There are also several Ayurvedic Hospitals in Travancore. There is an Ayurvedic College at Trivandrum. But I doubt whether these institutions are working satisfactorily.

Dr. A. G. MENON.

I have opened a Dispensary at Tattamangalam, and it is working well now. The existence of that Dispensary there is a great relief to the suffering. A Hospital would go on as long as its founder retain his enthusiasm for its development. If only it is brought under Government management, the institution could be worked well. In all other indigenous institutions, as long as the founder or the manager keeps that enthusiasm, it might work well. But that enthusiasm is never kept up for a long period. As long as his connection with the Dispensary continues, everything goes on well, and the moment he severs his connection, it falls to the ground. But if once the Government is to take over its management and conduct it properly, it will work well as other Ayurvedic Institutions. That is one of the reasons why Government should interfere in such matters.

DIWAN BAHADUR Dr. V. VERGHESE.

Is there any Ayurvedic Hospital efficiently run on the Malabar Coast?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

PRESIDENT.

There is the Trivandrum Ayurvedic Hospital. I don't know what its present condition is.

DIWAN BAHADUR Dr. V. VERGHESE.

It has been the subject of severe criticism in the Legislative Council, because an enormous sum of money was being spent on it year after year.

PRESIDENT.

How much do they spend ?

DIWAN BAHADUR Dr. V. VERGHESE.

I thought of writing to the Travancore Government to know the exact amount that is being spent year after year. I know only this much that a large sum of money is being spent on it, quite out of proportion to the income or benefit.

PRESIDENT.

We may benefit by their failure.

Dr. A. G. MENON.

My argument is also that a central institution must be created by the Government as an example to the other States and to the other institutions to follow. For want of Government encouragement, most of the Ayurvedic Hospitals cannot be thrown open to all the poor and suffering, and naturally, they have to fall down, in the course of a few years.

PRESIDENT.

You suggest our Anappara to be utilised for locating it, but the University Commission has recommended it for utilising it for the First Grade College.

Dr. A. G. MENON.

It was originally intended for a Hospital.

Mr. C. MATTHAI.

We have informed the University, and the University is expecting a report on that.

Dr. A. G. MENON.

I never knew of that. I thought that the building was constructed for a Hospital. It is intended more for a Hospital than a College.

PRESIDENT.

Have you seen the site for yourself ?

Dr. A. G. MENON.

No, Sir. From the answers given in this Hall, it was clear that it would serve the purpose of a Hospital only.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

PRESIDENT.

The University Commissioners have inspected the building, and have reported that it would be a first class site for a College.

Mr. S. F. NUNEZ.

Dr. A. R. Menon wants the Hospital in a town, but Dr. A. G. Menon now wishes to take it away to a village.

Dr. A. G. MENON.

Government may say that they have not got sufficient funds for the construction of a building. But I can show that there is building already constructed for the Hospital, and instead of an Allopathic Hospital, it may be converted into an Ayurvedic one. I am sure Government will not sanction such a large sum. Government will say that such decent buildings are not necessary for an Ayurvedic Hospital.

PRESIDENT.

I suppose the Sankariah Home near Anappara will be more suitable and quite sufficient.

Dr. A. G. MENON

There should be a garden attached to the Ayurvedic Hospital.

PRESIDENT.

What became of the Trichur Ayurvedic Samajam? They had some idea to purchase some plot, and they asked for Government help for the same. How do you account for its failure?

Mr. K. GOVINDA MENON.

Government aided it, but the failure was due to mismanagement.

Dr. A. G. MENON.

Government did not interfere. That was the sole reason. It must be a Government concern, and that is the proposition before us. We want Government institutions and not aided ones.

Mr. E. IKKANDA WARIAR.

The subject has been elaborately discussed in this House, and I don't propose to repeat the arguments in support of it. It has been brought to the notice of this House that this system is not thriving, or there are no Ayurvedic Hospitals which are said to be in a thriving condition throughout the whole of India. What is the reason for it? I shall give one. What is the pay given to the Chief Medical Officer in the Karaleeya Vaidyasala at Shoranur? What is the pay given to the Chief Medical officer of the State?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

PRESIDENT.

In the Vaidyasala, if I remember correctly, they give Rs. 40 to the physician in charge.

Mr. S. F. NUNEZ.

So the member wants to make the Ayurvedic Vaidyans also raised to the same standard of the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer.

Mr. E. IKKANDA WARIAR.

Certainly I do, if you want to revive this ancient system of medicine. They must at least be given the same status, if not the pay. What I say is that in these days when Ayurvedic physicians are making Rs. 700 to Rs. 1,000 a month, could we get a good medical officer, a good and efficient Ayurvedic physician to take charge of an Hospital on this magnificent pay of Rs. 40? And even if we can get a doctor for that pay, we cannot expect him to pay his undivided attention for the good of the Hospital.

PRESIDENT.

There is one Mr. Sanku Wariar at Cheruvirutti. He is a very clever and efficient doctor. Is it not so?

Mr. E. IKKANDA WARIAR.

Yes, Sir. I know him.

He is the chief physician in that Hospital. I know that he is a very skilful and efficient doctor, but I am sure he is not giving his undivided attention to the work in that Hospital. If I remember right, he is asked to be present there only one or two days in a week. Perhaps he goes there one evening and comes back the next morning.

PRESIDENT.

He has very capable assistants.

Mr. E. IKKANDA WARIAR.

That may also be true, Sir. But what I wish to emphasise is that this system is dying out for want of encouragement. There are *Ashtavaidyans* in Kerala. Unfortunately, they are getting old. They and the system of medicines which they practice are not given the encouragement which they really deserve. We can avail ourselves of their services now if we want. So the sooner we begin to start an Ayurvedic Hospital under Government management the better. We should not waste a minute, if we should get the best men available to organise a Central Hospital. If we waste time in discussing this matter indefinitely and wait till better times come for money to spend upon it, the talent which is available now to the State will be lost.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

PRESIDENT.

You despair about these *Ashtavridyans*?

Mr. E. IKKANDA WARIAR.

No doubt the Sastras are rich, and they are there. But it is common knowledge that it is not so widely and efficaciously practised now as in the last generation. Persons who call themselves doctors, and who are not able to understand the real significance of the Sastras, and who do not know the real usage of the same parade themselves as doctors. How much can we expect from them?

PRESIDENT.

They are training pupils under them. We can get their services.

Mr. E. IKKANDA WARIAR.

What is the training given by these doctors? The Chief Vaidyan in the Keraleeya Vaidyasala finds time to be there only at the most for two days in the week, and he is supposed to train up pupils. These pupils are awarded certificates at the end of two years, and they become full-fledged medical practitioners. How much can we expect from them? What does any other system do? It gives a five years' training, and it would be considered lucky, if any one passes in the examination after his five years' course. So, unless the Government comes to the help of this ancient and glorious system of medicine, and spends some substantial amount to encourage this movement, the prospect of improving this system is rather gloomy.

Mr. A. B. SALEM.

In the State, where the old indigenous system of Ayurveda prevailed for a long time, and where we have had an Allopathic system for only 50 years, the charge has been made that Ayurveda has not been encouraged. It is a very serious charge, and it is regrettable that the Government of this country, who ought to have known the value of the Ayurveda, have neglected Ayurveda and its studies. Sir, I have had the advantage of hearing some of the very educated doctors, and it has been proved beyond doubt that the scientific basis of Ayurveda is exactly the same as the scientific basis of the Allopathic or Western system. The science is the same. The Medicines of Ayurveda are purer than the extracts we get from the commercial people of the West. Here is a country with vast areas for cultivating the herbs used for medicine, and therefore, I have great pleasure in supporting the amendment brought forward that a small factory should be added to the Hospital with

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

a garden attached to it. But, Sir, these are problems which are not easy of solution. We have not got a set of Ayurvedic doctors now existing in the country with the same skill, status in life as the doctors of the Allopathic system. That is the main difficulty. To solve that difficulty I would throw out a suggestion that the Government should attach to every Dispensary and every Hospital that exists in the State an Ayurvedic doctor as well.

PRESIDENT.

So you go counter to Dr. Menon's proposition. He wants to separate the whole thing.

Mr. A. B. SALEM.

I do not go counter to Dr. Menon's proposition. My idea is that there is no necessity to level a charge against the Chief Medical Officer.

Dr. A. G. MENON.

We never said anything against the Chief Medical Officer.

Mr. A. B. SALEM.

To every medical institution existing in the State, Ayurvedic doctors selected by the Government may be attached, and that will give them training in the clinical part of the work as well. If an Ayurvedic physician is attached to a town Hospital, he will know how to give first aid, and what the value of operations are, and he will learn something of the Western system out of the practice that is given to him in the Hospital. It will go a long way to solve the problem that the Hon'ble Member for Irinjalakkuda had brought forward. Clinical work we want, and for clinical work we must have these institutions in the town, and you have got institutions in the town. A ward or certain number of beds may be given to the Vaidyan to treat. Supposing we have got a medical ward of 20 beds, five beds may be given to the Vaidyan to treat. A comparative statement of the merits and the demerits of the two treatments can be had, when they are going on side by side. After all, it is the relief of human suffering that is in view. Whether it comes about by Western medicine being administered to the patient or by the Ayurvedic medicine being administered to him, it would not matter much. What matters is the curing of the disease. And there have been cases in which Allopathic doctors have given up the patient, and Ayurvedic doctors have taken him in hand, and recovered him to life and *vice versa*, so that it is the relief of the suffering that should be kept in view, and it should be the aim of the Government to encourage

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Ayurveda by an Ayurvedic Vaidyan being attached to the Allopathic Hospitals as well. Thus we would get a set of men who are trained, and who have come in touch with the most organised, and most scientifically based system of the West. Here we have got some knowledge scattered, sometimes even considered sacred, as sometimes the Vaidyans will not give out their secrets, except at the point of death itself, and sometimes bury the knowledge with themselves. In these matters, they will be liberalised out of their crude notions, and we would get a set of men who could be sent round the country to administer the Ayurvedic system in the villages. I throw out this suggestion, and I am one who supports this proposition that an Ayurvedic system must be equally, if not in a better degree, encouraged. It goes to the relief of the poor, and the medicines are cheaper than the Western medicines.

Mr. I. E. AMBOOKAN.

I stand to oppose this resolution, not because, that I am one who likes the Allopathic system more than the Ayurvedic system. On the contrary, I believe that the Ayurvedic system is much more harmless than the other. The system of medicine is only a form of scientific research, and hence it should be based strictly on scientific principles. In the Ayurvedic system, much of science and reason cannot be found, and hence, I suppose, it was believed that it was originated from Brahmavu, the God himself.

Mr. S. F. NUNEZ.

Is there any science in divine things?

Mr. I. E. AMBOOKAN.

It is only a religious point of view. Then it becomes a religious question.

Dr. A. G. MENON.

Anything connected with religion will attract more attention, and will give more value in the eyes of the people. Hence a divine origin is attributed to the Ayurvedic Science.

Mr. I. E. AMBOOKAN.

Some of my Hon'ble friends here also stated the same view yesterday. If this statement is true, I say that only those who are able to believe in that Brahmavu, as God Almighty, can be able to have a faith in this system also. I do not like this to make a religious question, and therefore, I stop here with regard to its principle.

Now, let me speak a few words about the effects of this system. In my humble opinion, the Ayurvedic system can

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

never give as good results as the Allopathic system, so long as it is not properly reorganised by such big and influential hands as the former has at present. The value and glory which we see now attached to the Allopathic system are only the results of the high degree of care that has been devoted to it. Does anybody think that our Government will be able to revive the system of Ayurveda? I think that present condition of things will not allow the Government to give up the Allopathic system from our State, as soon as many think.

In the last, I say that both Allopathy and Ayurveda have not given me so much satisfaction as the Homeopathy.

Mr. M. K. RAMAN.

It is only figuratively correct.

PRESIDENT.

Can I expect you to bring a resolution on this subject?

Mr. I. E. AMBOOKAN.

Yes, next time I am going to bring a resolution on this subject.

It is the most scientific, the most harmless, the most convenient, the most medical, the most natural, and the cheapest way of treatment.

Mr. M. K. RAMAN.

I regret very much that my brother member for the Northern Ezhuva Constituency is not present when this interesting discussion is going on. I may say that many of my caste men by profession are Vaidyans. Although some other profession is attributed to us, I would consider this to be our hereditary profession, more than the profession that is likely to be attributed to us by other people. In fact, almost every Ezhuvan in the southern district of Travancore go by the name of a Vaidyan, whether he knows anything of Vaidyam or not. I may ask this House, if the Member for the Northern Ezhuva Constituency had all the facilities of the Chief Medical Officer of our State, if he were provided with a Hospital equally well equipped, what would have been his position? Without any of these, we have come to know of his efficiency. I do not know whether there is any place throughout Malabar or even in South India, where his name is not heard. I just brought his illustration to show the efficiency of the Ayurvedic system of treatment. In my opinion, in some cases, it is much more successful than the Allopathic system. I do not mean any insinuation against the English system of treatment. But there are certain diseases, I

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

understand, for instance, rheumatism, and others, which could be cured completely only by the Ayurvedic system of treatment. Where the English treatment has failed, I know several instances where the Ayurvedic physicians have given relief. To say that it is not so efficacious as the Allopathic treatment will be very much against the truth. It is a pity that, in our State, we do not encourage our old system of medical science. In fact, if only we can establish a Central Hospital in the town similar to the one at Trivandrum, with a botanical garden attached to it, I think it will be much more useful than these Allopathic Hospitals. There is this advantage that it will cost us far less than the English system. All the Allopathic Dispensaries cost us very much. A few thousand rupees may be spent as an experiment. We shall try a Central Hospital at Trichur or Ernakulam. If only we give fair and liberal grants to the starters of the Ayurvedic Dispensaries in the mofussils also, I am certain that in the course of a few years the Ayurvedic Hospitals will be able to compete with the Allopathic Hospitals, and perhaps outdo the same. I am, therefore, very glad to support this resolution.

I also support the amendment brought forward by the Hon'ble Member for Trippunittura. There should also be a factory attached to it, and an institution to teach young men who want to get a training in the system. The results which our people have obtained through both these treatments will bear convincing testimony to the fact that the Ayurvedic system excels the Allopathic system in several aspects. I think the Ayurvedic system has also got a surgical department, but that is not so much put into practice now. It is true that the instruments used by the Western medical men are more up-to-date. But Ayurvedic physicians also undergo a training in the use of the modern instruments. That is what is being done at Trivandrum now.

PRESIDENT.

They have got a College there.

Mr. M. K. RAMAN.

Yes, Sir. So far as the surgical department is concerned, they take the help of the doctor with some English degree, and thereby make a happy combination of the two. Perhaps surgery is the only portion where the Ayurvedic system is not up-to-date, and that is supplemented by the instruction imparted by a man of Western medical science. Thereby the students get the benefit of both the Ayurvedic and also of the modern scientific instruments of the Allopathic system. I, therefore, request this House to pass this resolution unanimously.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Mr. S. F. NUNEZ.

The real facts involved in this resolution have been pointed out by Mr. M. K. Raman. The question at issue is whether we should improve the Ayurvedic system of treatment or not. At present there is no such system as the Ayurvedic system, because, the system is not based on scientific principles.

Dr. A. R. MENON.

May I know what the meaning of the word 'scientific' is?

Mr. S. F. NUNEZ.

I am glad of this interruption, because it gives me an opportunity once more to express the view that there is no system worth the name 'scientific' in Ayurveda. I do not disparage the system.

PRESIDENT.

Have you gone into the details of the Ayurvedic system? Those who have gone through say that it isperfectly systematic.

Mr. S. F. NUNEZ.

It is not necessary that one should have gone into the details of the system to know whether it is systematic or not.

Now, Sir, what I wish to bring before the House is this:—We have to improve the indigenous system on more up-to-date lines. I say this, not because I have an aversion towards the Ayurvedic system, but it is my love for the Ayurvedic treatment that induced me to point out its defects and its present unsatisfactory condition. If you want to improve our friends, the best thing is to recognise their defects and to make these defects known to them. Here we have the Ayurvedic system, which we all love ardently, but the deplorable fate of which, at present, we all wail over. If we want to rectify that system and to improve it on up-to-date lines, we must have, however, a scientific institute, where the knowledge of some of the most eminent doctors is highly essential. There is Mr. Thekkat Moose, who is an acknowledged doctor in Ayurveda and whose service the Government must utilize, and he will be certainly glad to place at its disposal his knowledge and talents. Then all other Vaidyans can be trained under him. Why should the Government waste enormous sums of money on the construction of big buildings and on the purchase of all sorts of apparatus? It would be sufficient, if we have fine thatched sheds. We must go in for the services of those eminent physicians like Mr. Moose. We should also give liberal grants to the Ayurvedic Hospitals run by private agencies, even though it may cost a lakh of rupees or more. Now, young

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

men could be trained under these Vaidyans who may be employed in the Government Dispensaries which may be established in course of time. The present suggestion is to put the cart before the horse. Before we equip ourselves, we want to start a Hospital and to appoint some Vaidyans. They may kill even more people than the present Allopathic doctors. What we have to do is to establish an Ayurvedic College on the same lines as those of Travancore and Madras, which may be located at Ernakulam or Trichur. It should be in a suitable place where there is accommodation for the buildings and space for a botanical garden. We must have our own drugs made and herbs planted. In short, we must make all possible arrangements for the furthering of Ayurvedic knowledge. In the initial stages we must equip ourselves with sufficient knowledge, and that knowledge should be diffused and disseminated in rural parts, especially. In towns like Ernakulam and Trichur, we have got large numbers of Allopathic doctors, and we can obtain medical aid at any time of the night or day. But, in rural parts, the existing Dispensaries do not provide for the medical needs of all the poor patients. The knowledge which would be gathered as a result of the establishment of an Ayurvedic College or Institute may be utilized in the interests of the poor by establishing Ayurvedic Dispensaries in rural tracts. I say we will be doing a greater blessing to posterity, if we do so, than by all these rhetorical and eloquent descriptions of the glories and beauties of the Ayurvedic system. which was, no doubt, the wonder of the world at one time. Who has not heard of the immortal Charaka who was a world-renowned physician? We also read that, when Alexander the Great came to India, he had to employ Indian doctors to treat diseases which Greek physicians could not cure. In those days the Ayurvedic system must have been highly developed to work such wonders. But my contention is that, for some cause or other, Ayurveda fell into evil days in later times, and we have lost many of the secrets of the system. Still, something must be done to revive its old glories and to make it once more a source of benefit to the suffering humanity.

Mr. C. A. KUNJUNNI RAJA.

A point or order, Sir. He has exceeded his time.

Mr. S. F. NUNEZ.

I have finished.

PRESIDENT.

He has not exceeded his time. I have noted that he begin at 12—45. What is the time now?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Mr. C. A. KUNJUNNI RAJA.

My recollection is that he started at 12—40. If it is at 12—45, I beg your pardon.

PRESIDENT.

Mr. Nunez, you have not exceeded your time. I will allow you to speak.

Mr. S. F. NUNEZ.

I stand for the Ayurvedic system. I am not a wit behind others in my admiration for the Indian culture, but that is no reason why we should out-weigh our reason by our sentiment. Before we start an Ayurvedic Hospital, organised and fully equipped, we must have Ayurvedic Colleges. The system of Ayurveda should be placed on better and more up-to-date lines. This would enable the Vaidyans to have good knowledge of Physiology, Anatomy, Surgery, etc., and thus they will be better qualified to cure diseases.

It is not the point at issue. The point before us is to establish an Institute or to aid the Institutions run by private agencies. Will the Government start a Medical College on the same lines as that of Travancore? It may be at Ernakulam, it may be at Anappara or anywhere. We are concerned with the fact that it must be in a suitable place, where there is ample accommodation for a big College and also space for a botanical garden.

Mr. C. A. OUSEPH.

Sir, I fear the course of discussion that has been going on here on this matter of establishing an Ayurvedic Hospital has to some extent, clouded the issue before us. As the Member for Anglo-Indians remarked, reason has to be placed before sentiment and not sentiment before reason. We have, fortunately or unfortunately, been placed in a position to carry out measures which are to be applicable to a million of our co-citizens, provided, of course, that the Government sanctions them. That should not lead us to carry out any measure according to our likes and dislikes, or according to our sentiments. Our object should be to do things which would be the most beneficial to the people of the State. Therefore, Sir, as the Member for the Jews remarked, in this issue, the main question for us to consider is whether Ayurveda is preferable to Allopathy or whether Allopathy is preferable to Ayurveda, not from standpoints of sentiment, but according to the dictates of reason. The question is which system can relieve the suffering of the people more easily and at a smaller cost? The functions of Allopathy as well as of Ayurveda are to cure the patients of their diseases. As far as the Government is concerned, and as far as this House

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

is concerned, that is the only question for us here. Therefore, the point is whether Allopathy is better, or Ayurveda is more suited or whether both are useful in their own way. It is from these standpoints that we should approach this question. During the last 50 years, we have been using Allopathy. We have succeeded to some extent and failed to some extent. Now, the claims of Ayurveda have been placed before us. Here we should not be moved by sentimental considerations. We have to see whether Ayurveda is suitable. I should not be misunderstood. I am not opposing the motion. But, Sir, in supporting the motion, we should not go straightway and ask the Government to introduce Ayurveda all at once. We have to be guided by the experience of the past. We have had some Vaidyasalas in some parts of the State. We have to see what were the things that the Government did there, and what is the experience that we have gained from the Vaidyasalas. We have had an Ashtangahridaya Medical Store which had enrolled Government support, and from its life we can more or less learn how far we can succeed in opening the Medical Factory that the amendment contemplates. We had a Hospital in Cheruvirutti also supported by the Government, and this can teach us more or less about the methods that we have to pursue to successfully treat patients under this Ayurvedic system. Therefore, Sir, what I say is, we should enquire, investigate, and find out how far we have succeeded, and wherein we have failed in applying the principles of Ayurveda to treat patients under that system. It is only after finding out, after proper investigation, what are the methods to be pursued that we should take up any such scheme as is recommended in this resolution.

Mr. I. E. AMBOOKAN.

By whom to be investigated?

Mr. C. A. OUSEPH.

By scientists and physicians. If we have no scientists or physicians, we must get them. A lay body like us cannot give definite opinion on such an important matter as that. Therefore, I say it should be properly investigated by persons that are fit, and it is only after that any demand should be made to the Government. I say, if an Ayurvedic Hospital is a necessity for the people, and if by introducing methods of Ayurveda we can treat the patients at a cheaper rate and better than in Allopathy, certainly we should accept it. I only say that there should be proper investigation before we make any commitment. I do not know what experience we have already had. Some years ago many said that the Ayurvedic system was useless. Just now, one member said Homeopathy is more suitable,

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Another may say—unfortunately the Muhammadan Member is not here—if he had been present, he might have said—that the unani system is preferable. Another might say that Louis Kuhne's system of treatment is the best in the world. Therefore, I say no system should be stuck up to as the best. We must take in all that is best in every system, and we should be guided therein by the money at our command.

Mr. M. K. RAMAN.

We did not here discuss that we should set aside other systems and introduce the Ayurvedic system.

Mr. C. A. OUSEPH.

I did not understand it in that light.

PRESIDENT.

He said that only after investigation it should be introduced.

Mr. C. A. OUSEPH.

I am opposed only to hasty commitments in this matter. We have done something in this Ayurvedic line. Let us see what we have done and whether we have failed or succeeded. As for the Medical Factory, I am entirelyopposed to it. I do not think there is any place where medicine factories are conducted by Governments.

Mr. A. B. SALEM.

There is France.

Mr. C. A. OUSEPH.

I am speaking about Allopathy. In Allopathy all medicines are prepared by some private firm or other. It would be waste of money for the Government to start an Ayurvedic factory. We have got many instances of Government undertakings—the tanneries, the potteries, etc., which should teach us a lesson. There is something making it inherently impossible for the Government to work up such schemes successfully. Therefore, I strongly oppose the amendment. With regard to the resolution, provided that Government won't make any hasty commitments, I support it.

Dr. A. R. MENON.

I propose that the question be put to votes.

Mr. M. K. RAMAN.

I second it.

The closure motion was put to votes and carried.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

PRESIDENT.

The resolution before us is this " *that this Council recommends to the Government to establish a Central Ayurvedic Hospital in the State* ". There are two amendments to this resolution. One by Dr. Govinda Menon, and that is to the effect that the Government should establish a Central Ayurvedic Hospital in the State in the Anappara buildings lying vacant near Trichur. The other amendment is by Mr. K. S. Rama Ayyar, and that is to the effect that " *this Council recommends to the Government to establish a Central Ayurvedic Hospital in the State with a Medicine Factory attached to it, and that encouragement should be given to the Ayurvedic system of medicine by opening Dispensaries wherever possible under duly qualified Vaidyans. The Government may also see if, the services of Mr. K. Sankara Menon, a son of the soil, who is now Director of Ayurveda in the State of Travancore, cannot be had for organising the Hospital, the Factory and the Dispensaries and for being in charge of the department, at least for some years at the outset*".

The resolution as well as the amendments have been fully discussed, and I think it better to put the resolution first to votes.

Mr. K. T. MATHEW.

There is no necessity for putting the resolution to the votes. The resolution. as it stands, has been accepted. Only the amendments need be put to the votes. Is the Government opposed to the original resolution ?

PRESIDENT.

So far as the Government is concerned, they have simply stated they are not opposing the resolution in the sense that they do not want it. The question is being considered. This all what the Government says. You need not take it to be one of opposition or one of total consent.

Mr. M. K. RAMAN.

The idea of the Government is not explained.

PRESIDENT.

The Government will consider the thing. I am in favour of putting the resolution to the votes.

The resolution was put to the votes and carried.

PRESIDENT.

I will now put to the votes the amendment proposed by Dr. Govinda Menon.

The amendment was put to the vote and was lost by 20 against 7.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Mr. A. B. SALEM,

Sir, I want a poll.

A poll was taken with the following result:—

Ayes.

1	Mr. A. Eachara Menon	5	Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja
2	Dr. A. G. Menon	6	,, N. Padmanabha Menon
3	Mr. E Ikkanda Wariar	7	,, K. Sankaran Nambudiri
4	,, C. N. Ittiravi Nambudiri		

Noes.

1	Mr. K. Achyuta Menon	11	Mr. T. K. Krishna Menon
2	,, V. K. Aravindaksha Menon	12	,, K. Krishna Pisharodi
3	,, Chakko Cheruvattur	13	,, C. Matthai
3	,, P. Damodara Menon	14	,, S. F. Nunez
4	,, George Chakyamuri	15	,, C. A Ouseph
5	,, K. Govinda Menon	16	,, I. Raman Menon
6	,, K. P. Karuppan	17	Mr. Sheik Abdul Qadir Sahib Bahadur
7	Rao Sahib Mr. T. V. Kasturi Ranga Ayyar	18	Mr. V. B. Vaidyanatha Ayyar
10	Mr. V. K. Kochunni Menon	19	Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese
11	,, S. S. Koder	20	Mr. H. J. Walmesly

PRESIDENT.

I will now put to the vote the amendment proposed by Mr. Rama Ayyar.

The amendment was put to the votes and lost.

The Supply of Alwaye water to Mattancheri.

PRESIDENT.

We will now take into consideration the next resolution, i. e., the resolution standing in the name of Mr. S. S. Koder.

Mr. S. S. KODER.

Sir, I beg to move the resolution standing in my name "*that this Council recommends to the Government that* (1) *Alwaye water be brought by boats in pipes or tanks and stored in Mattancheri for the use of the public of that place, or* (2) *tube-wells be constructed as is being done at Nemmara and water supplied by pipes.*"

Sir, in moving this resolution I have to bring to the notice of this House that the population of Mattancheri is nearly 25,000; the Municipal income is 56,000; and revenue about 11,000. Now, Sir, it is a well-known fact that contaminated water is the cause of cholera, dysentery, elephantiasis, etc. The first two are very dangerous and the last loathsome. We are told that cholera, owing to some cause unexplainable, visits Madras once in a certain number of years. I think it is five years. But in Mattancheri we have this fearful visitor almost every year during the hot weather. You have all seen how dreadful it looks when a person has got elephantiasis on his legs, and when it begins to break out, it is in no way averse to

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly